

Turangi Township Report 1995

Turangi Township Report 1995

(Wai 84)

Waitangi Tribunal Report: 10 WTR

Original cover design by Cliff Whiting, invoking the signing of the Treaty of Waitangi and the consequent development of Maori-Pakeha history interwoven in Aotearoa, in a pattern not yet completely known, still unfolding

**Waitangi Tribunal Reports
ISSN 0113-4124
ISBN 0-86472-196-X**

**© Crown copyright 1995
First published 1995**

**Set in Times New Roman
Published by Brooker's Ltd, Wellington, New Zealand
Printed by Astra Print, Wellington, New Zealand**

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

We would like to thank a number of staff who assisted us at various stages throughout the hearings and report writing; in particular, Mata Fuala’au for secretarial and word processing assistance and Pam Wiki for claims administrative duties, including the hearing arrangements. An exploratory report for this claim was prepared by John Koning, and Paul Hamer produced a report on the Tokaanu development scheme from 1930 to 1968. Both reports were produced in evidence. Paul Hamer assisted with research in the course of the proceedings and with the report writing. Dean Cowie also assisted with the report writing, including the checking of sources. The report was edited and produced by Dominic Hurley and Kate Riggir.

We also record our appreciation of the cartographic work of Max Oulton, of Waikato University, in the preparation and production of the maps and figures in the report.

LIST OF CONTENTS

Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1 Introduction.....	1
1.2 Development of the claim	2
1.3 Reports commissioned by the Tribunal	7
1.4 When and where the claim was heard.....	7
1.5 Findings and recommendations.....	7

Chapter 2: Historical Overview

2.1 The Turangi district from the 1920s to the 1960s	9
2.2 The Tokaanu development scheme	13
2.3 The Tongariro power development	20
2.4 The choice of the township site	24

Chapter 3: Meetings with Ngati Turangitukua in 1964

3.1 Background	33
3.2 15 April 1964 meeting.....	34
3.3 7 May 1964 meeting with Tuwharetoa Maori Trust Board representatives	35
3.4 24 May 1964 meeting of Maori landowners with the Crown	36
3.5 31 May 1964 meeting of Ngati Turangitukua committee with owners	39
3.6 20 September 1964 meeting of Ngati Turangitukua owners with Crown.....	41

Chapter 4: Undertakings and Assurances

4.1 Definitions of undertakings and assurances	45
4.2 Introduction to review of the undertakings.....	46
4.3 Undertakings 1–3	46
4.4 Undertakings 4–7	51
4.5 Undertakings 8, 9, 17	54
4.6 Undertaking 10.....	57
4.7 Undertakings 11–13	58
4.8 Undertakings 14–16	61
4.9 Undertakings 18–20	62
4.10 Conclusion	64
4.11 The Tribunal’s finding	64

Chapter 5: The Bulldozers Arrive: A Review of the Turangi Township Development

5.1 The township takes shape.....	67
5.2 Ministry of Works publicity pamphlets	69
5.3 Frustration at development work.....	72
5.4 Brief review of land requirements	72
5.5 A delegation meets with the Prime Minister.....	75

Chapter 5—continued

5.6 Discussions between the Ministry of Works and the Tuwharetoa Maori Trust Board	76
5.7 An ordinary country town?	77
5.8 The commercial and residential areas	78

Chapter 6: The Industrial Area

6.1 Introduction	91
6.2 15 April 1964 meeting of Ngati Tuwharetoa with officials	91
6.3 7 May 1964 meeting of trust board with Ministry of Works	91
6.4 24 May 1964 meeting of owners with the Crown	93
6.5 20 September 1964 meeting of owners with the Crown	94
6.6 Cabinet approves the leasing of industrial land	94
6.7 The Ministry of Works enters the land	95
6.8 The Crown seeks to resile from the undertaking	96
6.9 Crown abandons leasehold of industrial area	97
6.10 3 March 1968 meeting of owners with the Crown	99
6.11 The May 1968 meeting with the Minister of Works	105
6.12 A further change of mind	106

Chapter 7: Turangi Township: Further Developments

7.1 The water supply reserve	113
7.2 The rubbish tip	118
7.3 The Tongariro River	121
7.4 The Tokaanu River	130
7.5 The Tokaanu Power Station and tailrace	135

Chapter 8: Wahi Tapu

8.1 Te Puke a Ria	145
8.2 Ngati Apakura Urupa	147
8.3 Nga Tuahu	147
8.4 Te Waiariki Urupa	149
8.5 Te Waiariki Pa	153
8.6 Te Urupa a Hinenamu	153
8.7 Kohatu Kaioraora	154
8.8 Ruakoiwi	154
8.9 Wahi tapu and ‘salvage archaeology’	155

Chapter 9: The Oxidation Ponds

9.1 Introduction	161
9.2 Initial construction	164
9.3 Compensation sought for land affected by stopbank	167
9.4 The disposal of the effluent	169
9.5 Tribunal’s comments	174
9.6 Claimants express concern	175
9.7 Conclusions	176

Chapter 10: The Residual Lands West of the Turangi Township	
10.1 Introduction.....	179
10.2 Zoning and provision of services	179
10.3 The Hangarito Stream drain.....	184
10.4 Compensation for metal extraction	187
10.5 Unresolved matters	190
Chapter 11: From Hydro Town to County Town	
11.1 Introduction.....	191
11.2 Boom towns	191
11.3 Housing layout	192
11.4 Dynamics of new towns	193
11.5 Employment and related problems	194
11.6 Control is transferred to the Taupo County Council	197
11.7 Failure to return surplus land	198
Chapter 12: Impacts on Ngati Turangitukua	
12.1 Introduction.....	201
12.2 Ngati Turangitukua perceptions of impact	202
12.3 The rehousing of Ngati Turangitukua families	214
12.4 The transition from rural to urban	227
12.5 The assessment of impacts.....	235
Chapter 13: Statutory Framework: The Powers of the Crown	
13.1 Introduction.....	243
13.2 Crown powers of land acquisition	243
13.3 Crown entry on land.....	247
13.4 Was notice of entry by the Crown required?	251
13.5 The Turangi Township Act 1964	254
13.6 Areas taken by proclamation.....	259
13.7 Summary.....	259
Chapter 14: The Assessment of Compensation	
14.1 Statutory provisions.....	263
14.2 The involvement of the Maori Trustee.....	266
14.3 Compensation for lands taken in 1965 and 1966	271
14.4 Agreement reached	279
14.5 Repeal of Maori Trustee's statutory powers	281
14.6 Tribunal's conclusions.....	282
14.7 Treaty implications	282

Contents

Chapter 15: Treaty Principles	
15.1 Introduction.....	283
15.2 The cession of sovereignty was in exchange for the protection of rangatiratanga.....	284
15.3 The principle of partnership.....	288
15.4 Fiduciary obligations of the Crown.....	289
Chapter 16: Crown Legislation and the Treaty	
16.1 Preliminary.....	291
16.2 The Public Works Act 1928, the Turangi Township Act 1964, and the Treaty.....	295
16.3 Submissions of claimant counsel.....	295
16.4 Crown counsel's submissions.....	296
16.5 Are the Public Works Act 1928 and the Turangi Township Act 1964 inconsistent with Treaty principles?	300
16.6 Relevant statutory provisions	301
16.7 Tribunal's finding.....	302
Chapter 17: Crown Treaty Breaches	
17.1 Introduction.....	305
17.2 Claimants' allegations	305
17.3 Practicable alternatives to purchasing the site.....	308
17.4 Offer back provisions	313
17.5 Conclusions relating to the offer back procedure.....	319
17.6 Tribunal's finding	320
17.7 Deficiencies in sections 40, 41, and 42 of the Public Works Act 1981	320
17.8 Tribunal's finding relating to the Public Works Act 1981.....	323
Chapter 18: Crown Treaty Breaches as to Consultation	
18.1 Introduction.....	325
18.2 1955 meeting at Hirangi Marae.....	325
18.3 1964 correspondence and meetings	326
18.4 Further correspondence in 1964.....	334
18.5 20 September 1964 meeting.....	336
18.6 24 September 1964 meeting.....	337
18.7 Crown counsel on consultation	338
18.8 Tribunal's consideration of consultation conducted by the Crown	338
18.9 Conclusions on consultation.....	341
18.10 Tribunal's finding.....	342
18.11 Crown consultation during the construction of the township.....	343