

TURANGA TANGATA

TURANGA WHENUA

TURANGA TANGATA
TURANGA WHENUA

THE REPORT ON THE
TURANGANUI A KIWA CLAIMS

VOLUME II

WAI 814

WAITANGI TRIBUNAL REPORT 2004



The cover design by Cliff Whiting invokes the signing of the Treaty of Waitangi and the consequent interwoven development of Maori and Pakeha history in New Zealand as it continuously unfolds in a pattern not yet completely known

A Waitangi Tribunal report

ISBN 1-86956-275-5

www.waitangi-tribunal.govt.nz

Typeset by the Waitangi Tribunal

Published 2004 by Legislation Direct, Wellington, New Zealand

Printed by SecuraCopy, Wellington, New Zealand

Set in Adobe Minion and Cronos multiple master typefaces

CONTENTS

VOLUME I

Letter of transmittal	xiii
Executive summary	xv
CHAPTER 1: THE INQUIRY	
1.1 Introduction	2
1.2 The interlocutory process	2
1.3 Hearings	3
1.4 Historical evidence	4
1.5 Inquiring into mandate	5
1.6 Inquiry boundary	9
CHAPTER 2: TURANGANUI A KIWA: THE CLAIMANTS	
2.1 Distinctions between claimant groups	12
2.2 ‘Hapu or iwi’ communities	14
2.3 Community rights in land	16
2.4 The principal Turanga claimants	19
2.5 Concluding comments	38
CHAPTER 3: WAERENGA A HIKA: ‘THE HINGE OF FATE’ IN TURANGA	
3.1 Introduction	39
3.2 1840 to 1865: whose Turanga?	43
3.3 Waerenga a Hika	62
3.4 Crown and claimant cases	94
3.5 Tribunal analysis and findings	104
CHAPTER 4: EAST COAST LEGISLATION	
4.1 Introduction	125
4.2 Early confiscation policy in Turanga	128
4.3 Crown and claimant cases	158
4.4 Tribunal analysis and findings	161

CONTENTS

CHAPTER 5: THE STORY OF TE KOOTI AND THE WHAKARAU

5.1	Introduction	169
5.2	The detention of Turanga Maori on Wharekauri.	171
5.3	Crown and claimant cases on the detention of the Whakarau	189
5.4	Tribunal analysis and findings	192
5.5	The Whakarau and Turanga	195
5.6	Crown and claimant cases on the return of the Whakarau and the attacks at Matawhero	207
5.7	Tribunal analysis and findings	210
5.8	Ngatapa, January 1869.	219
5.9	Crown and claimant cases on Ngatapa	227
5.10	Tribunal's analysis on Ngatapa	229
5.11	Tribunal findings	244
5.12	Epilogue.	248
5.13	The Claim by Nga Uri o Te Kooti.	251

CHAPTER 6: TURANGA DEED OF CESSION 1868/CROWN RETAINED LANDS

6.1	Introduction	253
6.2	Turanga deed of cession, 1868	256
6.3	Who ceded for whom?	269
6.4	The Crown's retained lands.	273
6.5	The claim of Joseph Anaru Hetekia Te Kani Pere on behalf of Te Whanau a Wi Pere and others	324
6.6	Compensation for the Patutahi cession	327
6.7	Conclusion	338

CHAPTER 7: THE POVERTY BAY COMMISSION, 1869-73

7.1	Introduction	339
7.2	Adjudicating claims to the returned lands: process and jurisdiction	342
7.3	An instrument of punishment	350
7.4	Cleaning up past mistakes – the commission validates settler titles.	368
7.5	Specific claim – the Wi Pere Whanau and the Pouparae block	376
7.6	Transforming customary title	379
7.7	1873: the end of the Poverty Bay Commission	388
7.8	The Significance of the Work of the Commission	392

VOLUME II

CHAPTER 8: THE NATIVE LAND COURT AND THE NEW NATIVE TITLE

8.1	Introduction	395
8.2	The Native Land Court as adjudicator	407
8.3	The individualisation of Maori title	426

CONTENTS

CHAPTER 8: THE NATIVE LAND COURT AND THE NEW NATIVE TITLE—*continued*

- 8.4 Was the Native Land Court system simple and efficient while providing adequate safeguards for Maori in land dealings? 446
- 8.5 Did the new title system result in Maori alienating more land in Turanga than if community title had been recognised from the outset? If that was the effect, did the Crown intend it? 469
- 8.6 Conclusions and the Treaty 533

CHAPTER 9: THE PRICE OF COMMUNITY CONTROL: THE TURANGA TRUST LANDS, 1878–1955

- 9.1 Introduction 539
- 9.2 The history of the trusts 540
- 9.3 Crown and claimant cases 549
- 9.4 Tribunal analysis and findings 551
- 9.5 What was the long-term impact on Turanga iwi of the failure of successive initiatives by Rees and Pere? 568

CHAPTER 10: TE HAU KI TURANGA

- 10.1 Introduction 587
- 10.2 The Crown's acquisition of Te Hau ki Turanga. 589
- 10.3 The ownership of Te Hau ki Turanga 598
- 10.4 The custodial history of Te Hau ki Turanga since Crown acquisition 602
- 10.5 Current management 605

CHAPTER 11: THE TRIAL OF HAMIORA PERE

- 11.1 The trials 610
- 11.2 Tribunal analysis and findings 622

CHAPTER 12: PUBLIC WORKS

- 12.1 Introduction 627
- 12.2 The Crown's ability to take Maori land under public works legislation. 627
- 12.3 Public works takings in the Turanga district – some examples. 631
- 12.4 The Crown and claimant cases. 645

CHAPTER 13: RATES

- 13.1 Introduction 649
- 13.2 Maori and rating law – a brief background 649
- 13.3 Rates – a cause of the loss of Maori land at Turanga? 651
- 13.4 The Crown's case. 652
- 13.5 The claimants' case. 653
- 13.6 Tribunal analysis and findings 653
- 13.7 Rates – the Cookson claim 653

CONTENTS

CHAPTER 14: MANGATU TITLE DETERMINATION – THE NGARIKI KAIPUTAHĪ STORY

14.1 Introduction	659
14.2 Jurisdiction	661
14.3 The Ngariki Kaiputahi case.	662
14.4 The Crown case	663
14.5 The 1881 hearing	663
14.6 The determination of relative interests, 1916–17	679
14.7 The introduction of Te Whanau a Taupara.	684
14.8 Tribunal finding and analysis.	693

CHAPTER 15: MANGATU AFFORESTATION

15.1 Introduction	697
15.2 The afforestation of Mangatu	698
15.3 Towards afforestation	703
15.4 The Crown and claimant cases.	727
15.5 Tribunal analysis and findings	728

CHAPTER 16: HEI WHAKAMAHUTANGA: THE HEALING

16.1 The Treaty established a nation based on the rule of law	735
16.2 The Treaty stood for just and fair Government	737
16.3 The Treaty ensured that the Crown would respect Maori autonomy	738
16.4 The Turanga stories must be told	739
16.5 Who can settle?.	741
16.6 Loss and reparations.	743
16.7 Values and comparisons	748
16.8 Hei Kapinga Korero	751

APPENDIX I: RECORD OF INQUIRY

Record of hearings	755
Record of proceedings.	757
Record of documents	781

APPENDIX II: THE NATIVE LAND ACT 1873

The Native Land Act 1873.	805
-----------------------------------	-----

APPENDIX III: A LEGACY OF PROTEST

A legacy of protest	835
Glossary.	845

TABLE OF MAPS

VOLUME I

Map 1: The Gisborne inquiry district	6
Map 2: The eastern boundary of the Gisborne inquiry district	8
Map 3: The location of marae in the Gisborne inquiry district	10
Map 4: The land blocks within the Gisborne inquiry district.	20
Map 5: Detail of the central blocks on and around the Gisborne flats	22
Map 6: The southern land blocks in the Gisborne inquiry district	37
Map 7: Places of conflict, 1864–67, showing Waerenga a Hika	41
Map 8: Raupatu boundaries as shown on Chapman’s map of the North Island, 1865–66.	141
Map 9: Biggs’ proposed cession, 1867	146
Map 10: The 1869 sketch map presented to the Poverty Bay Commission	<i>facing page 280</i>
Map 11: The five blocks that later comprised the Te Muhunga block	288
Map 12: A representation of the survey of 1873.	292
Map 13: Bousfield’s 1873 survey plan	<i>facing page 294</i>
Map 14: A representation of the survey of 1873	306
Map 15: A representation of the 1869 sketch map	309
Map 16: The Tribunal’s view of the 1869 sketch map	312
Map 17: A representation of Bousfield’s 1873 survey plan	317
Map 18: A representation of the 1869 sketch map	320
Map 19: A representation of the 1869 sketch map	320
Map 20: Old land claims granted by the Poverty Bay Commission, 1869.	369

VOLUME II

Map 21: Blocks awarded Crown grants and land passed through the Native Land Court	396
---	-----

TABLE OF FIGURES

VOLUME I

Fig 1: Mangatu Incorporation offices	26
Fig 2: Rongopai Marae	29
Fig 3: Mangatu Marae	31
Fig 4: Manutuke Marae	35
Fig 5: Muriwai Marae	38
Fig 6: The Gisborne waterfront, with the settlement in the background, 1867	43
Fig 7: Turanga, Archdeacon Williams, 1855	45
Fig 8: <i>Native Christian Church at Turanga, New Zealand</i>	47
Fig 9: Waerenga-a-Hika Mission Station, circa 1858	90
Fig 10: The remains of Waerenga a Hika Pa after its capture and destruction in 1865	93
Fig 11: Poverty Bay massacre memorial	205
Fig 12: Armed Constabulary, Gisborne massacre, 1868	221
Fig 13: James Richmond, <i>Ngatapa from the East</i> , 1869	225

VOLUME II

Fig 14: Sled house	480
Fig 15: Close up of sled house runner	481
Fig 16: Sheepdipping at Barker's holding, Whataupoko, 1895.	522
Fig 17: Maori leaders of Gisborne, circa 1908.	541
Fig 18: Read's Quay Wharf, 1896	544
Fig 19: Rukupu Epa from Te Hau ki Turanga.	586
Fig 20: Te Hau ki Turanga.	588
Fig 21: Makaraka racecourse under flood water, 1950.	696
Fig 22: Flooding, Evans-Nield, 1910.	696

ABBREVIATIONS

AJHR	<i>Appendix to the Journal of the House of Representatives</i>
AJLC	<i>Appendix to the Journal of the Legislative Council</i>
app	appendix
Archives NZ	National Archives of New Zealand
ATL	Alexander Turnbull Library
BPP	<i>British Parliamentary Papers: Colonies New Zealand</i> (17 vols, Shannon: Irish University Press, 1968–69)
c	circa
CA	Court of Appeal
ch	chapter
CMS	Church Missionary Society
comp	compiler
DNZB	<i>The Dictionary of New Zealand Biography</i> (5 vols, Wellington: Department of Internal Affairs, 1990–2000)
doc	document
DOSLI	Department of Survey and Land Information
ed	edition, editor
ha	hectare
IA	Internal Affairs file
JHR	<i>Journal of the House of Representatives</i>
Le	Maori–English lexicon file
LS	Lands and Survey file
ltd	limited
MA	Maori Affairs file
MS	manuscript
n	note
NZLR	<i>New Zealand Law Reports</i>
NZPD	<i>New Zealand Parliamentary Debates</i>
OLC	old land claim
p, pp	page, pages
para	paragraph
PC	Privy Council
pt	part
RDB	<i>Raupatu Document Bank</i> (139 vols, Wellington: Waitangi Tribunal, 1990)
ROI	record of inquiry
s, ss	section, sections (of an Act)
sec	section (of this report, a book, etc)
SOC	statement of claim
TROTAK	Te Runanga o Turanganui a Kiwa
vol	volume

‘Wai’ is a prefix used with Waitangi Tribunal claim numbers

Unless otherwise stated, footnote references to claims, papers, transcripts, and documents are to the record of inquiry, which is reproduced in appendix 1.

